Photographs of the Brazilian Civil-Military Dictatorship in history textbooks

Abstract
The objective of this article is to analyze the photographs of the Dictatorship present in textbooks that were circulated in Brazil from 1990 to 2015, from the visual culture’s point of view. Taking into consideration that the history textbook is a cultural product, endowed with complexity, we seek to understand its role as creator of cognitive and memory processes. Therefore, we searched ten textbooks edited during this period (and some reissued around that time), three of which are used in this article. Some changes in the use and choice of images were observed, such as the presence of portraits of military presidents, very present in the books edited in the 1990s, and opposition movements against the regime, which finally graced the pages of books around the 2000s. The survey and cataloging of these images may generate, not only categories for analysis, but new understandings about the changes in the way we perceive Brazilian’s Military Dictatorship, from its inception to the present time.

Keywords: History teaching; Textbooks; Visual culture; Photography.

To cite this translation:

DOI: 10.5965/2175180308172016292
http://dx.doi.org/10.5965/2175180308172016292
Photographs of the Brazilian Civil-Military Dictatorship in history textbooks

Carolina Martins Etcheverry

Fotografias da Ditadura Civil-Militar brasileira em livros didáticos de história

Resumo
Este artigo tem por objetivo analisar as fotografias da Ditadura presentes nos livros didáticos em circulação no Brasil no período de 1990 a 2015, a partir do ponto de vista da cultura visual. Levando-se em consideração que o livro didático de história é um produto cultural dotado de complexidade, procura-se entender o seu papel como engendrador de processos cognitivos e memoriais. Para tanto, foram pesquisados dez livros didáticos editados no período (e alguns reeditados), dos quais três são utilizados nesse artigo. Algumas mudanças na utilização e na escolha das imagens foram observadas, a exemplo da presença de retratos dos presidentes militares, muito presentes nos livros dos anos 1990, e de movimentos contrários ao regime, que passam a aparecer nas páginas dos livros dos anos 2000. O levantamento e catalogação dessas imagens poderão gerar, além de categorias de análise, novos entendimentos sobre a alteração do modo como passamos a compreender a Ditadura Militar, desde seu surgimento até o presente momento.

Palavras-chave: Ensino de história; Manuais didáticos; Cultura Visual; Fotografia.

Introduction
The article seeks to address the photographs of the Brazilian Dictatorship present in textbooks, in the period between 1990 and the 2000s, to realize the change of use and presentation of these photographs during this time interval. Therefore, we established two axes of analysis to encompass the scope of the proposed theme. Firstly, we propose a critical presentation of the textbooks in general and, specifically, their treatment of the Dictatorship. Understanding the textbook as a cultural product endowed with complexity, we sought to show how it influences its users (understood here as students
and teachers), acting as a bridge between the knowledge produced by historians (despite the expected delay, until it hits the publishing market), the parameters established by the government and the needs of the publishing market. In this sense, the use of iconographic material has undergone major changes over the years, in accordance with the rules established by the National Textbook Program (Programa Nacional do Livro Didático - PNLD) and with the advancement in studies of the image field and the visual culture\(^1\), and thus requires the need to invest in visual literacy.

Lastly, the second part of this article deals specifically with photographs whose subject is the Dictatorship and its presentation in textbooks. We tried to understand how these photos were displayed in different periods (i.e., in the 1990s, early 2000s) in textbooks geared to Elementary and High schools. In addition, we sought to understand which images were chosen in each period and how they were worked by the authors – whether problematized or if they served only to illustrate the page layout, for example.

**Textbook and images**

The textbook is a learning tool used by teachers in the classroom as a way to support the content being taught. Given its scope, we can consider it one of the main teaching tools, especially in Brazilian public schools.

Regarding the textbook as an object of study, Kazumi Munakata (2012) states that

> In Brazil, the work of Circe Bittencourt (1993) represented the initial impulse of a vast production that occurred the following decades, by having presented a set of themes and approaches that the object contained beyond the denunciation of ideology. The thesis, later published as a book in 2008 (...), was about the textbook being an public educational policy, and that leaned towards issues like the editorial production of this object to the market, its inclusion in the school as a constituent device of knowledge and school culture, its importance to the support of school subjects (in particular, History) and the uses and practices that surround this material. (MUNAKATA, 2012, p. 183)

\(^1\) We understand visual culture as the study field born at the beginning of the 1990s, and that involved the production, the circulation and the consumption of images. Plentiful are the images we receive daily from newspapers, magazines and the internet, and that require from us deeper reflection on the way we handle them and the role they play in our society. Regarding this, see DIKOVISTKAYA (2006), GUASH (2005) and KNAUSS (2006).
The textbook can be understood as a cultural product endowed with complexity, that, because its educational and instructive function is mediated by several factors, primarily including the author, the publisher and the government, responsible for establishing parameters for its content. “He is, at the same time, a commodity, a support for school learning, for pedagogical methods, a vehicle for a system of values”, defends Circe Bittencourt (2011, p. 302).

Alain Choppin (2004) lists some functions that the textbook has in the classroom, including the *documentary function*, which may act in the development of a student's critical thinking over textual and iconic documents. Regarding the images, it is necessary to alphabetize look, that is, to teach it to see images and decry it automatic understanding. It is necessary for the look to be smart, critical, incisive, through what Lorenzo Vilches (1997) calls the cognitive encyclopedia, which generates a semantic competence in those who look.

The images in textbooks, according to Ana Maria Mauad, have two main functions: to educate and to instruct. From the educational point of view, the image “is the support of social relationships symbolizing, in different ways, the values with which society identifies and recognizes as universal” (MAUAD, 2015, p. 85). The instructional point of view is exemplified by the author using the evidentiary aspect of the image, which has the ability to show characteristics from other times, allowing the student to view material and immaterial aspects of societies from the past. In this sense, the images of the textbooks should make sense to the community of readers, that is, such images must “harness its use to its function in the visual economy of its time”.

The photographs, it is worth remembering, are not neutral objects. They go through a process of choices, ranging from the camera and film used to the editing of the image for publication. In the midst of it all is the photographer, also a part of the culture of his time, making choices appropriate to his time period. Boris Kossoy (2002) writes about a succession of choices from which the photograph is but the result. According to

---

2 The Nacional Commission of Textbooks (CNLD) dates back to 1938, a precursor to the PNLD, created in 1985.
the author, “the photographic image is, thus, a representation that results from the *process of creation/construction of the photographer*” (KOSSOY, 2002, p. 30).

One of the most striking characteristics of photography is its polysemic nature. This means that, in addition to what is shown in the picture, we have the reader and his cultural background influencing the understanding of the picture. In addition, it can engender multidisciplinary interpretations, due to its evocative power. In the words of Boris Kossoy,

> The image's reception implies the inner workings of the interpretation construction process, a process that is based on the photographic evidence and that is elaborated in the minds of its recipients, in accordance with their cultural personal repertoires, their knowledge, their ideological/aesthetic conceptions, their moral, ethical, religious convictions, their economic, professional interests, their myths. (KOSSOY, 2012, p. 44)

Photography can also be understood as a choice among many possible choices. Thus, we perceive that a photograph strongly depends on the photographer’s role, who is the one choosing where to point his camera, as well as choosing that which will be left out of the photo frame. The frame and the extra-frame are the photographer’s choices, depending on their ethical, moral and cultural orientation, as well as their political and ideological points of view. The photograph is a fragment of a reality that is in front of the photographer, and it is this cut, which is determined by these choices.

Photographs are carriers of their own historicity, when studied in their materiality. Each image carries the mark of the time they were registered, the photographic click, and the choices made by the photographer. The photographers, in this sense, act as social agents, transposing their social reality to the photographic image.

According to Ana Maria Mauad (2015),

> The set of visual images that compose a textbook can be considered as an iconographic set, or even, iconography. The iconography of textbooks is historically defined using the visual coding system composed of agencies that contribute to the social production of the image, including: the different types of media, advertising and the visual arts in general. Currently, History textbooks incorporate both the academic debate on the critical use of visual sources by the subject of History, and the
discussions on what school knowledge understands as History. It uses different types of images that aim to educate and at the same time instruct. (MAUAD, 2015, p. 84)

The concern with the way images are treated shows that they are not present in the book only as illustrative accessory, but have their own role within the teaching proposal. Some recent authors have been concerned with the role of image in textbooks, beginning with Circe Bittencourt in the 1990s, and followed by Ana Maria Mauad (2015), Valesca de Souza Almeida (2014), and Aristeu Castilhos da Rocha (2008).

Ana Maria Mauad, in an article about the uses and functions of public photography in History school knowledge, surveys the presence of various types of images in textbooks (maps, photographs, historical illustration, painting, film scenes, poster/advertising, cartoons/comics and infographics), seeking to associate the visual history of the production of historical knowledge in the school environment (Mauad, 2015). According to the author,

Nowadays there is the use of visual images, both to educate and to instruct. In western pictorial tradition, at first, the visual images constituted the set of social representations that, by educating the look, defined the ways of being and acting, projecting ideas, tastes, aesthetic and moral values. They are a part of today's catalog of contemporary visuality conveyed by newspapers, television, filmic and virtual media. (...) In History textbooks, the visual image also has this double function: its use is not limited only to accessory illustrate verbal content. This requires some care that deserve consideration in the evaluation of the uses and functions of the visual image in the History textbooks, no matter the public it targets: be it children, adolescents or young people. (MAUAD, 2015, p. 83)

This care with the uses and functions of the image in textbooks was also researched by Valesca de Souza Almeida, using the armed struggle through textbooks. The author analyzed five books of the last year of High School, to verify how the images of armed conflicts are presented to the readers. The author criticizes the linear approach textbooks afford the Dictatorship in the books analyzed, making the student see the period as a succession of actions taken by the different presidents. For each of the five books analyzed, Almeida identifies the representative images of the armed conflicts, as follows:
As iconography, still in the paragraph that spoke of the armed conflict, we have an image of the hundred thousand march, identifying the faces of Chico Buarque, Caetano Veloso, Paulo Autran and Gilberto Gil. (ALMEIDA, 2014, p. 10)

In another book, the author identifies the same photograph of the hundred thousand march, of theater artists demonstrations, the Roda Viva program and the Tropicália artists. There is also a photograph of cars destroyed in attack that happened in 1976 in Copacabana, a photograph of Marighella and a photograph depicting the repression that took place in the seventh day Mass for the deceased student, Edson Luís. The author points out that there are issues that are independent of the will of the authors and that should be taken into account, “for example, the page limit for a chapter, the layout, the impossibility of using an image that the publisher would rather not have to pay for” (ALMEIDA, 2014 p. 18).

Ana Maria Mauad (2015, p. 86) lists some items that should be taken into account when analyzing the images of textbooks. The first is “to give rise to an in-depth historical understanding of the represented subject”, in other words, it is not an image out of place with no meaning or relationship with the text. The second item is “being historically identified according to their nature (…)” and the third implies “being accompanied by their origin”, that is, if it comes from a file, an image bank, a museum or another type of collection. The image needs adequate readability (not too small or poorly printed), to be accompanied by “critical inquiries on the visual nature of the representation – painting, photo, movie, map” and, lastly, not serving only to illustration the content presented in the text.

Evidence of this concern with the treatment of images can be seen in the regulations established by the National Textbook Program (PNLD), where we can read what is observed is textbooks, for the purposes of its analysis, showing, among others, the following criteria:

- illustrations that exploit the multiple functions of images, to assist the learning of visual literacy and the teaching of History (…) images accompanied by reading and interpretation and interaction activities, whenever possible, referenced in their source condition for the production of historical knowledge (BRASIL, 2015, p. 14).
Photographs of the Dictatorship in textbooks

The choice and the treatment that the photographs of the Military Dictatorship period were given in textbooks is something that has suffered visible transformation over the years. We analyzed textbooks from primary and high school published within 20 years, from the 1990s and 2000s, and we perceived both an increase in the number of images published and a difference regarding which images were chosen for use.

We researched ten textbooks in total, selected using the following criteria: availability (were readily available for research), scope (have national circulation) and known authors (recognized in the history field). We prioritized those books published by major publishers, since audience reach would be greater. For the choice of books from the year 2000 and onwards, we tried to combine the above criteria with the analysis present in the PNLD. For this article, we present the preliminary results of this research using three books, chosen due to their content reflecting the overall results of the survey up to this date.

By analyzing the different textbooks, it was possible to establish some categories for the photographs chosen by the authors and the editors. They are: military tanks and apparatus, demonstrations, political activists and politicians persecuted and personalities linked to the military regime. These categories were perceived due to the recurrence of these photographs in several books, nearly always the same ones. They settle what we call visual memory of the Dictatorship, or its iconosphere (set of guide-images), according to Ulpiano Bezerra de Meneses (2005).

The photograph of Vladimir Herzog, killed by the agents of repression in the DOI-CODI home base of São Paulo is one such example. In textbooks, this episode of the history of Brazil appears in one of two ways. In the books from the early 1990s and those geared towards Primary School, the picture we have is a picture of Herzog. The story of his death is exposed in the text, and the issue of Piletti & Piletti (2004) we have acquired, a student wrote down in pencil “Rubens Paiva and Vladimir Herzog did not survive”. In books destined for High Schools, the picture attached to the death of Herzog is one that the agents of repression took to indicate his supposed suicide (below, to the right).
Photographs of the Brazilian Civil-Military Dictatorship in history textbooks
Carolina Martins Etchevery

The presence of military apparatus, such as the tanks, is common especially in the images that accompany texts regarding the coup that occurred in March 31, 1964. The image below is from the book “History of Brazil: analysis and reflection”, written by Roberson Oliveira and published in 1998, in which we have 60 pages dedicated to the Military Dictatorship, divided into three chapters. Altogether, there are 24 pictures accompanied by captions, like the one exemplified below. We can see, in the foreground, two military vehicles on a street in diagonal plane, following the line of tall buildings and lampposts, implying it is a great avenue. The vehicles are to overflowing with military donning helmets and weapons. No civilians can be seen in the picture, only military, both in the car and in the street. Captions claims they are “tanks on the streets, in April 1964”, right after the March 31st coup. In addition, we read that “once again, the democratic

3 The vehicles are the M3-A1 Scout Car, the first 4x4 shielded car on wheels owned by the Brazilian Army, acquired in 1941-1942.
normality in the country is broken”, making it clear that the presence of the military on the streets denotes a break from the urban routine, i.e. a state of exception.

Aristeu Castilhos da Rocha (2008), in his thesis on the military regime in High School textbooks, presents a table listing the presence of images in several books since 1978. The first photograph found by the author was in a 1979 book, one of only 31 images present in the analyzed book: the March of the Family with God for Freedom⁴. In the same year, in another book, there is an image of the people and the army on the street. In the absence of the image, we could infer that it was a photograph of repression on some demonstration. We can see that photography begins to timidly appear, even during the military regime.

⁴ March of the Family with God for Freedom (Marcha da Família com Deus pela Liberdade) was the name given to a series of marches that occurred in March and June of 1964, as a reaction of the conservative sectors of society regarding the base reforms and the supposed communist invasion.
The number of Dictatorship photographs increases as we move away from the 1964 coup and in the 1980s it is a very recurrent way of presenting the heavy years, still present in the early 1990s, from different military governments, each represented with a 3x4 style photograph of its president, as we can see in the figure below, followed by a text explaining the events of each government.

Figure 5 - COTRIM, 1993.
This way of representing through official images a historical period as important as the Military Dictatorship for our recent history, leads us to the idea of public photography. They are official photographs showing the president in a dignified pose, well dressed, in an official event. Public photography is linked to the notions of power and ideology inserted in the new political history. According to Ana Maria Mauad (2013):

Studies on photography and history indicate that it becomes public to perform a political function, which ensures the transmission of a message to give visibility to the strategies of power, or still, to disputes of power. (...) It is, therefore, the agency support of a public memory that records, retains and designs in the historical time, a version of events. (MAUAD, 2013, p. 13)

By presenting the visual history of the Dictatorship only through portraits of military presidents, the authors and the publishers make a choice that confirms the competence and the importance of these characters. By associating the dictatorial period to these pictures (the portraits of presidents), it can be said that there is production of meaning and the creation of a symbolic capital that reiterates the exercise of power by these characters, even though this historical period has long since ended.

In more recent books, we still find photographs of presidents, but in smaller numbers and other analytical perspectives. An example is the president Geisel photograph taken by the photographer Orlando Britto (below). In the book page, the picture appears in the upper right corner, small in size. The highlight of the image is not the president but the eagle that, from the upwards angle, eventually overrides the president, who is waving to the people in the lower left corner of the image. The Geisel figure, in black and white photography, mingles with details on the building wall relief, in whose balcony he stands. The triangular geometric shape of the wall guides the viewer’s gaze toward the eagle, which is in the last and the brighter plane of the image. The photograph, despite being of the president – and therefore authorized to circulate in newspapers, magazines and textbooks – has as its main character the eagle, weakening the presidential figure and subverting the traditional order of the official photographs of

---

5 Not only that, the figure of an eagle is a reference to the famous Nazi symbol, linked, among others, to the idea of absolute power that the eagle establishes over its preys.
the presidents. In the classroom, a teacher with a properly educated look in images and what they can offer to the viewer is able to guide their students to understand the nuances of this photograph. Another approach would be researching the photographer, inserting him in the history of Brazilian photojournalism, as we see in his testimony about this image:

I used to work in the O Globo newspaper and covered the day-to-day Congress and the Republic Presidency. At the time of the military regime, the president traveled almost every week. And it was precisely during the coverage of the visit that General Geisel made to the city of Vitória, in the Espírito Santo State, that I took this picture, as he came to the balcony of the Anchieta Palace, in the city center. (BRITTO, 2013)

We can do a comparative analysis of the books by Nelson and Claudino Piletti, authors known for their collection History and Life, the same collection which has been edited for decades, always with revisions made by the authors. The Military Dictatorship is present in the second volume of the collection destined to Elementary School, both in the 1991 edition and the 2004 edition, both published by the publisher Attica.
In the 1991 edition, the Military Dictatorship is presented in Chapter 11, with nine pages and 10 photographs (three of them in color). In the 2004 edition, the Military Dictatorship is in Chapter 17, with 12 pages and nine photographs (none in color). Although it seems like a setback, since the newest edition has one image less than the former and none in color, the 2004 edition favors a layout much more focused on the analysis and reflection on the photographs, which are bigger and better located on the page.

Although the text continues to be presented in a linear fashion following the government of each president, the images chosen for the 2004 edition allow the student to realize more clearly the resistance that the Brazilian society offered. There is no image, like in the 1991 edition, that illustrates the economic miracle achieved by military governments, such as the pulp mills and the Jari Project and the View from the Rio-Niterói bridge used for this purpose.

The marches and demonstrations are, in general, the symbol of civilian resistance, appearing with great frequency in textbooks. Thus, the One Hundred Thousand March and the demonstrations in favor of Amnesty are photographs that serve as examples of popular dissatisfaction, as we can observe below, to the left.

Photographs from the One Hundred Thousand March are quite common in textbooks, attested by the examples above (Figure 7 and 8). They are often taken from above, in which it is possible to notice the presence of a lot of people with sashes (that cannot be read), circulating in a street that appears to be in the downtown area due to the presence of tall buildings.

In the caption of the History and Life book, from 2004, we read that

The death of the student Edson Luís caused anti-government demonstrations to become more widespread, including various sectors of society, like the middle class. The One Hundred Thousand March, held in Rio de Janeiro on July 25, 1968, was the high point of these demonstrations. (PILETTI & PILETTI, 2004, p. 154)

---

6 It is Worth remembering that the color photography was not widely used in this period, since images were, for the most part, destined for newspapers and magazines, publications that did not use colors for printing.
The other side of these demonstrations, i.e. the violence perpetrated by the government to suppress them, was not very often shown in textbooks from the 1990s. In the examples studied so far, we can see that the choice of photographs is to conceal the full impact of repression. In the 1991 book, we have a generic photograph showing the UNE headquarters building in Rio de Janeiro, and a busload of students arrested in the XXX UNE Congress in Ibiúna, in October 1968. In this photograph (above), we see students, inside the bus, offering their hands to the people outside it. In the foreground, a nun offers her hand to a student, showing her support.

In the 2004 book, we have more explicit photographs, in which enforcement agents appear, like in the photograph below, also of the UNE Congress. We see in the foreground four police officers, characterized by uniforms and helmets, gathered in a circle. In the background, we have several young students, some standing, others sitting. In the background, children, a cyclist, a truck. The caption reads
Students had an important role in the opposition to the military regime. The National Union of Students (UNE) was dissolved in 1964, but still continued to act illegally. In 1968, among the students arrested in the XXX UNE Congress, we had the main student leaders. (PILETTI & PILETTI, 2004, p. 154)

In conclusion

We do not intend to exhaust, obviously, the subject involving the photographs in textbooks, but to offer some pathways for its search, from the analysis of book chapters involving the Military Dictatorship theme. We chose this focus due to it being an important moment in Brazilian history that has been researched in depth in recent years.

Regarding the treatment of photographs, we try to understand how the changes in the selection and presentation of images occurred, taking into account both the temporal distance from the end of the military regime and the new market needs and parameters established by the federal government. There is a greater awareness that the image is a creator of meanings and that it should be understood in conjunction with the text, to generate meaning and the knowledge created by that union.

It is necessary to encourage authors and teachers to discuss and contextualize the images, presenting them as artifacts endowed with historicity, and not only as a certification of truth, an illustration or something to cover up blanks in diagramming. By contextualizing them, teacher and student make sense of the historical periods from a visual repertoire that is part of society. The circulation of images does not occur only through textbooks, but also through other media such as newspapers and the internet, making it important to educate the look, so we can critically look, complementing what is read with what looked at, searching for the intentions of the author and the photographer.

One of the main differences we could perceive throughout this study was precisely regarding the treatment the photograph received by its producer, i.e. the photographer. Although not explicitly mentioned in the text – which could enrich the study about this historical period –, the photographer’s name started being attached next to the image, names such as Orlando Britto, Juca Martins, Júlio Bernardes, Vincent Carelli and J.
Albuquerque. Many of these names are part of the Brazilian history of photojournalism, alongside their agencies, like F4 and Ágil. When referencing them, even if only by their names, without their history or the history of the images, the editors of the publications attribute them another layer of meaning, opening a possible pathway for the teacher.

In addition, there is a noticeable difference in the choice of images, leaving aside the long line of portraits of presidents and personalities from the military regime, in favor of showing more explicitly the other side, the government’s opposition. On this track, the repression becomes more visual than before, leaving behind its representation through music, literature and theater.

Images are an important part in the memory construction of the Dictatorship, in addition to recording events of the past, they also serve to activate, in those who read it, a recollection process. This process contributes to the projection of a better future for society, especially regarding traumatic events. In the case of Dictatorship photographs, we hope that, by studying them in depth and critically, we may be contributing to this recollection process, seeking a better future, in the hopes that the injustices of the past never be repeated.

References


Photographs of the Brazilian Civil-Military Dictatorship in history textbooks

Carolina Martins Etcheverry